



Telling the truth: arguments for and against

David Mortimore Baxter had caused a bit of trouble in the past by telling lies. He promised his mother he would only tell the truth. Otherwise she was going to send his dog Boris to a pet shelter.

Consider the advantages and disadvantages of always having to tell the truth. For each of the following situations, list arguments for and against David telling the truth.

Situation	Arguments for telling the truth	Arguments against telling the truth
David's mum asks him if he likes her veggie slice		
Rose Thornton asks David if he'd like to help her organise a special guest for her birthday party		
Ms Stacey wants to know if David would like to join Rose's group for his project work		
Victor asks David if he has been nice to Victor's cousin, Rose, lately		
David's mum asks him if he agrees that telling the truth is always the best thing to do		

*Notes may be downloaded and printed for regular classroom use only.

Walker Books Australia
Ph +61 2 9517 9577
Locked Bag 22
Fax +61 2 9517 9997
Newtown, N.S.W., 2042

These notes were created by Leonie Jordan. For enquiries please contact Leonie Jordan: leonie.jordan@walkerbooks.com.au

Notes © Black Dog Books

Consider all of your responses to the situations below. Do you agree with David's view that sometimes it makes more sense to bend the truth a little?

What if David hadn't been truthful?

David promised to tell the truth. For most of the story, he kept his promise, no matter how hard that sometimes was.

Imagine that David had not been so truthful all the time. What might the consequences have been if he had lied at the following times in the story?

Incident	Likely consequences of lying
<p>David's sister was angry when he was truthful about the way her hair looked. What if he paid her a compliment instead?</p>	
<p>David was given a detention despite telling the truth about doing his homework and leaving it at home. If he had lied, would things have been better for him?</p>	
<p>David upset the sick bay attendant with his honesty. What might have happened if he was more sympathetic?</p>	
<p>David got into trouble in music by copying Mrs Tozer's awful singing voice. Should he have been a little more flattering?</p>	
<p>Victor was annoyed when David told him that his sister Zoe thought Victor was weird. Would it have been wiser to lie a little?</p>	